

**SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
NEW YORK COUNTY**

PRESENT: HON. RICHARD LATIN **PART** **46V**

Justice

-----X

KEVIN VANDERMARK,

Plaintiff,

- v -

MASON TENDERS DISTRICT COUNCIL WELFARE FUND,
MASON TENDERS DISTRICT COUNCIL PENSION FUND,
MASON TENDERS DISTRICT COUNCIL ANNUITY FUND,
MASON TENDERS DISTRICT COUNCIL OF GREATER
NEW YORK

Defendant.

-----X

INDEX NO. 153365/2023

MOTION DATE 06/01/2023

MOTION SEQ. NO. 002

**DECISION + ORDER ON
MOTION**

The following e-filed documents, listed by NYSCEF document number (Motion 002) 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16

were read on this motion to/for MISCELLANEOUS.

Upon the foregoing documents, it is ordered that this unopposed motion for preliminary approval of a class action settlement is granted pursuant to the annexed order.

6/5/2023
DATE


RICHARD LATIN, J.S.C.

CHECK ONE:

CASE DISPOSED

NON-FINAL DISPOSITION

GRANTED

DENIED

GRANTED IN PART

OTHER

APPLICATION:

SETTLE ORDER

SUBMIT ORDER

CHECK IF APPROPRIATE:

INCLUDES TRANSFER/REASSIGN

FIDUCIARY APPOINTMENT

REFERENCE

**SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
COUNTY OF NEW YORK**

KEVIN VANDERMARK, individually and on
behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

MASON TENDERS' DISTRICT COUNCIL
WELFARE FUND, MASON TENDERS'
DISTRICT COUNCIL PENSION FUND,
MASON TENDERS' DISTRICT COUNCIL
ANNUITY FUND, and MASON TENDERS'
DISTRICT COUNCIL OF GREATER NEW
YORK,

Defendant.

Index No. 153365/2023

**PRELIMINARY APPROVAL
ORDER**

WHEREAS, a putative class action is pending in this Court entitled *Kevin Vandermark, et al. v. Mason Tenders' District Council Welfare Fund, et al.*, Index No. 153365/2023 (the "Action");

WHEREAS, Plaintiff KEVIN VANDERMARK, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated ("Plaintiff") and Defendants MASON TENDERS' DISTRICT COUNCIL WELFARE FUND, MASON TENDERS' DISTRICT COUNCIL PENSION FUND, and MASON TENDERS' DISTRICT COUNCIL ANNUITY FUND (collectively "Defendants") have entered into a Settlement Agreement (the "Settlement Agreement") that settles the above-captioned litigation and provides for a complete dismissal with prejudice of the claims asserted against Defendants in the Action on the terms and conditions set forth in the Settlement Agreement, subject to the approval of the Court;

WHEREAS, Plaintiff has made an application, pursuant to Article 9 of the Civil Practice Law and Rules, for an order preliminarily approving the Settlement in accordance with the

Settlement Agreement, certifying the Settlement Class for purposes of the Settlement only, appointing Plaintiff as Settlement Class Representative, appointing Class Counsel as counsel for the Settlement Class, appointing Postlethwaite & Netterville as Settlement Administrator, and allowing notice to Settlement Class Members as more fully described herein;

WHEREAS, the Court has read and considered: (a) Plaintiff's motion for preliminary approval of the Settlement, and the papers filed and arguments made in connection therewith; and (b) the Settlement Agreement and exhibits attached thereto; and

WHEREAS, unless otherwise defined herein, the capitalized terms herein shall have the same meaning as they have in the Settlement Agreement.

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:

1. **Class Certification for Settlement Purposes Only**. For settlement purposes only and pursuant to CPLR §§ 901(a), 903, and 907, the Court certifies, solely for purposes of effectuating the proposed Settlement, a Settlement Class in this matter defined as follows:

All persons who were sent notification by MTDC that their personal information was or may have been compromised in the Data Incident.

The Settlement Class includes approximately 40,349 people. The Settlement Class specifically excludes: (i) all Class Members who timely and validly request exclusion from the Settlement Class; (ii) the Judge assigned to evaluate the fairness of this settlement; and (iii) any other person found by a court of competent jurisdiction to be guilty under criminal law of initiating, causing, aiding or abetting the criminal activity occurrence of the Data Incident or who pleads *nolo contendere* to any such charge.

2. **Class Findings**: The Court provisionally finds, for settlement purposes only, that the requirements of CPLR § 901(a) have been met, including: (a) the Settlement Class is so numerous that joinder of all Settlement Class Members would be impracticable; (b) there are issues

of law and fact common to the Settlement Class; (c) the claims of the Settlement Class Representatives are typical of and arise from the same operative facts and seek similar relief as the claims of the Settlement Class Members; (d) the Settlement Class Representatives and Settlement Class Counsel will fairly and adequately protect the interests of the Settlement Class as the Settlement Class Representatives has no interest antagonistic to or in conflict with the Settlement Class and has retained experienced and competent counsel to prosecute this matter on behalf of the Settlement Class; (e) questions of law or fact common to Settlement Class Members predominate over any questions affecting only individual members; and (f) a class action and class settlement is superior to other methods available for a fair and efficient resolution of this controversy.

3. **Settlement Class Representative and Settlement Class Counsel:** KEVIN VANDERMARK is hereby provisionally designated and appointed as the Settlement Class Representative. The Court provisionally finds that the Settlement Class Representative is similarly situated to absent Class Members and therefore typical of the Class and that he will be an adequate Settlement Class Representative

The Court finds that Victoria Jennings Maniatis and Gary M. Klinger a of Milberg Coleman Bryson Phillips Grossman, PLLC are experienced and adequate counsel and are hereby provisionally designated as Settlement Class Counsel.

4. **Preliminary Settlement Approval.** The Court hereby preliminarily approves the Settlement, as embodied in the Settlement Agreement, as being fair, reasonable and adequate to the Settlement Class, subject to further consideration at the Final Approval Hearing to be conducted as described below.

5. **Final Approval Hearing.** A Final Approval Hearing shall be held on October 11, 2023 at 2:00 p.m., in the Supreme Court of the State of New York, County of New York, at the Courthouse located at 60 Centre Street, Room 130, New York, New York, [by videoconference] for the following purposes: (a) to determine whether the proposed Settlement on the terms and conditions provided for in the Settlement Agreement is fair, reasonable and adequate to the Settlement Class; (b) to determine whether a proposed Judgment substantially in the form annexed to the Settlement Agreement as Exhibit 5 should be entered dismissing the Action with prejudice against Defendants; (c) to determine whether the motion of Settlement Class Counsel for a Fee Award and Costs should be approved; (d) to determine whether the motion of the Settlement Class Representatives for Service Award Payment(s) should be approved; and (e) to consider any other matters that may be properly brought before the Court in connection with the Settlement. Notice of the Settlement and the Final Approval Hearing shall be given to the Settlement Class Members as set forth in Paragraph 7 of this Order.

6. The Court may adjourn the Final Approval Hearing without further notice to the Settlement Class Members, and may approve the proposed Settlement with such modifications as the Parties may agree to, if appropriate, without further notice to the Settlement Class Members.

7. **Retention of Claims Administrator and Manner of Giving Notice.** Class Counsel is hereby authorized to retain Postlethwaite & Netterville (the “Settlement Administrator”) to supervise and administer the notice procedure in connection with the proposed Settlement as well as the processing of Claims as set forth more fully in the Settlement Agreement.

8. **Approval of Form and Content of Notice.** The Court (a) approves, as to form and content, the Notice, the Claim Form, and the Summary Notice, attached to the Settlement Agreement as Exhibits A, B and C, and (b) finds that the mailing and distribution of the Notice as

set forth in the Settlement Agreement (i) is the best notice practicable under the circumstances; (ii) constitutes notice that is reasonably calculated, under the circumstances, to apprise the Settlement Class Members of the pendency of the Action, of the effect of the proposed Settlement (including the releases to be provided thereunder), of Class Counsel's request for Fee Award and Costs, of Settlement Class Representatives' request(s) for Service Award Payment(s), of their right to object to the Settlement, Class Counsel's request for Fee Award and Costs, and/or Settlement Class Representatives' request(s) for Service Award Payment(s), of their right to exclude themselves from the Settlement Class, and of their right to appear at the Final Approval Hearing; (iii) constitutes due, adequate and sufficient notice to all persons entitled to receive notice of the proposed Settlement; and (iv) satisfies the requirements of CPLR §§ 904 and 908, the United States Constitution (including the Due Process Clause), and all other applicable law and rules. The date and time of the Final Approval Hearing shall be included in the Notice before they are mailed and distributed.

9. **Participation in the Settlement.** Settlement Class Members who qualify for and wish to submit a Claim Form shall do so in accordance with the requirements and procedures specified in the Notice and the Claim Form, and must do so within sixty (60) days after Notice is sent to the Settlement Class Members. If Final Order and Judgment is entered, all Settlement Class Members who qualify for any benefit under the Settlement but fail to submit a claim in accordance with the requirements and procedures specified in the Notice and the Claim Form shall be forever barred from receiving any such benefit, but will in all other respects be subject to and bound by the provisions in the Settlement Agreement, the Release included in that Settlement Agreement, and the Final Order and Judgment.

10. **Claims Process and Distribution and Allocation Plan.** Settlement Class Representative and Defendants have created a process for assessing and determining the validity and value of claims and a payment methodology to Settlement Class Members who submit a timely, valid Claim Form. The Court preliminarily approves the claims process described in the Settlement Agreement and directs that the Settlement Administrator effectuate the distribution of Settlement consideration according to the terms of the Settlement Agreement, should the Settlement be finally approved.

11. **Exclusion from Class.** Any Settlement Class Member who wishes to be excluded from the Settlement Class must mail a written notification of the intent to exclude himself or herself from the Settlement Class to the Settlement Administrator at the address provided in the Notice, postmarked no later than **60 Days from the date of Notice** (the “Opt-Out Period”). The written notification must include the name of the proceeding, the individual’s full name, current address, personal signature, and the words “Request for Exclusion” or a comparable statement that the individual does not wish to participate in the Settlement at the top of the communication.

Any Settlement Class Member who does not timely and validly exclude herself or himself from the Settlement shall be bound by the terms of the Settlement Agreement. If Final Order and Judgment is entered, any Settlement Class Member who has not submitted a timely, valid written notice of exclusion from the Settlement Class shall be bound by all proceedings, orders, and judgments in this matter, including but not limited to the Release set forth in the Final Order and Judgment, including Settlement Class Members who have previously initiated or who subsequently initiate any litigation against any or all of the Released Persons relating to the claims and transactions released in the Settlement Agreement. All Settlement Class Members who submit

valid and timely notices of exclusion from the Settlement Class shall not be entitled to receive any benefits of the Settlement.

12. **Objections and Appearances.** No Settlement Class Member shall be heard, and no papers, briefs, pleadings, or other documents submitted by any Settlement Class Member shall be received and considered by the Court, unless the objection is mailed first-class postage prepaid to the Settlement Administrator at the addresses listed in the Notice, and postmarked by no later than the Objection Date, as specified in the Notice. For an objection to be considered by the Court, the objection must also include all of the information set forth in Paragraph 45 of the Settlement Agreement, which is as follows: (i) the name of the proceedings; (ii) the Settlement Class Member's full name, current mailing address, and telephone number; (iii) a statement that states with specificity the grounds for the objection, as well as any documents supporting the objection; (iv) a statement as to whether the objection applies only to the objector, to a specific subset of the class, or to the entire class; (v) the identity of any attorneys representing the objector; (vi) a statement regarding whether the Settlement Class Member (or his/her attorney) intends to appear and wishes to be heard at the Final Approval Hearing; (vii) a list of all other matters in which the objecting Settlement Class Member and/or his/her attorney has lodged an objection to a class action settlement; and (viii) the signature of the Settlement Class Member or the Settlement Class Member's attorney.

13. Any Settlement Class Member who fails to comply with the provisions in Paragraph 12 may waive and forfeit any and all rights he or she may have to object, and shall be bound by all the terms of the Settlement Agreement, this Order, and by all proceedings, orders, and judgments in this matter, including, but not limited to, the release in the Settlement Agreement if Final Order and Judgment is entered. If Final Order and Judgment is entered, any Settlement

Class Member who fails to object in the manner prescribed herein shall be deemed to have waived his or her objections and shall be forever barred from making any such objections in this action or in any other proceeding or from challenging or opposing, or seeking to reverse, vacate, or modify any approval of the Settlement Agreement, the Service Award Request, or the Fee Request.

14. **Termination of Settlement**. This Order shall become null and void and shall be without prejudice to the rights of the Parties, all of whom shall be restored to their respective positions existing as of the date of the execution of the Settlement Agreement if the Settlement is not finally approved by the Court or is terminated in accordance with the Settlement Agreement. In such event, the Settlement and Settlement Agreement shall become null and void and be of no further force and effect, and neither the Settlement Agreement nor the Court's orders, including this Order, relating to the Settlement shall be used or referred to for any purpose whatsoever.

15. **Use of Order**. This Order shall be of no force or effect if Final Order and Judgment is not entered or there is no Effective Date and shall not be construed or used as an admission, concession, or declaration by or against Defendants of any fault, wrongdoing, breach, liability, or the certifiability of any class. Nor shall this Order be construed or used as an admission, concession, or declaration by or against the Settlement Class Representative or any other Settlement Class Member that his or her claim lacks merit or that the relief requested is inappropriate, improper, unavailable, or as a waiver by any Party of any defense or claim he, she, or it may have in this litigation or in any other lawsuit.

16. **Stay of Proceedings and Temporary Injunction**. Until otherwise ordered by the Court, the Court stays all proceedings in the Action other than proceedings necessary to carry out or enforce the terms and conditions of the Settlement Agreement. Pending final determination of whether the Settlement should be approved, the Court bars and enjoins Plaintiff, and all other

members of the Settlement Class, from commencing or prosecuting any and all of the Released Claims against the Released Entities.

17. The Court retains jurisdiction to consider all further applications arising out of or connected with the proposed Settlement.

18. **Summary of Deadlines.** The preliminarily approved Settlement shall be administered according to its terms pending the Final Approval Hearing. Deadlines arising under the Settlement Agreement and this Order include but are not limited to:

Notice Completion Deadline: 30 Days after Preliminary Approval

Motion for Final Approval: 30 Days before Final Approval Hearing

Motion for Service Awards, Attorneys' Fees and Costs: 14-Days prior to the Objection Deadline and Opt-Out Deadline

Opt-Out Deadline: 60 Days after Notice is sent to the Settlement Class

Objection Deadline: 60 Days after Notice is sent to the Settlement Class

Replies in Support of Final Approval, Service Awards and Fee Requests: 14 Days before Final Approval Hearing

Claim Deadline: 90 Days after Notice is sent to the Settlement Class

Final Approval Hearing: at least 110 Days after Preliminary Approval

IT IS SO ORDERED this 5th day of June, 2023.



Hon. Richard Latin, J.S.C.